## Minutes of a meeting of the WEST AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE on Tuesday 16 January 2018



## Committee members:

Councillor Upton (Chair)

Councillor Fooks

Councillor lley-Williamson

Councillor Cook (Vice-Chair) Councillor Hollingsworth Councillor Price

Councillor Clarkson (for Councillor Tidball)

## Officers:

Adrian Arnold, Development Management Service Manager Robert Fowler, Planning Team Leader Julia Drzewicka, Planning Officer Tobias Fett, Planning Officer Amy Ridding, Senior Conservation Officer Nadia Robinson, Planning Officer Caroline Robins, Lawyer, Law & Governance Catherine Phythian, Committee Services Officer

## Apologies:

Councillor(s) Tidball sent apologies.

## 55. Declarations of interest

### 17/01965/FUL

Cllr Cook - as a Council appointed trustee for Oxford Preservation Trust; and as a member of the Oxford Civic Society. He stated that he had taken no part in those organisations discussions or decision making regarding the application and was approaching it with an open mind.

Cllr Upton - as a Council appointed trustee for Oxford Preservation Trust. She stated that she had taken no part in the OPT discussions or decision making regarding the application and was approaching it with an open mind.

### 17/03039/LBC

Cllr Price – as a Trustee of the Museum of Oxford he had a pre-determined position on the application and would leave the room and take no part in its determination.

## 56. 17/02762/FUL: Holiday Inn Peartree Roundabout, Woodstock Road, Oxford, OX2 8JD

The Committee took this application first.

The Committee considered an application for the demolition of the existing Leisure Suite and the erection of a four-storey extension plus roof plant.

The Planning Officer presented the report and made the following verbal updates:

- In view of comments from Thames Water two further conditions are recommended which refer to a drainage strategy required before commencement and details of piling to be undertaken
- The landscape condition recommended in paragraph 10.29 is not listed in the conditions in the report but will be included

Stephen Brooker (agent) spoke in favour of the application and in response to questions from the Committee he confirmed that provisions for cycle parking would be made and that staff shower/locker facilities were already in place (Condition 4).

In discussion the Committee noted that the loss of the sports and leisure facilities, although regrettable, was not contrary to policy CS21 and that it would not be reasonable to refuse planning permission on that basis.

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it and concluded that the expansion of the hotel would be a welcome enhancement for tourism in the city.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

### The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

- (a) approve the application for the reasons given in the report and subject to the 13 required planning conditions set out in section 12 of this report and the additional three planning conditions detailed above;
- (b) grant planning permission; and
- (c) agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:

1. finalise the recommended conditions as set out in this report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary.

## 57. 17/02419/FUL: Dragon School Bardwell Road, Oxford, OX2 6SS

The Committee took this application next.

The Committee considered an application for the erection of new Music School, construction of a link to Lynam Hall, landscaping including the formation of a new courtyard, garden area to Lane House and entrance courtyard.

The Planning Officer presented the report and proposed that Condition 20 should be deleted as it was a duplicate of Condition 11. The Planning Officer referred to the second sentence of Paragraph 10.41 of the reports which states that *"The proposed building would enable all teaching to take place on the same side of Bardwell Road"* and for clarification explained that this will mean that all the Music Facilities will be on the same side of Bardwell Road.

Gervase Prosser, on behalf of Park Town Trustees, spoke against the application.

Martin Johnson, Bursar Dragon School, spoke in favour of the application; Graham Candy (School Governor), James Roach (Architect) and Lucy Smith (Agent) were present to answer questions.

The Committee discussion focussed on, but was not limited to, the following points:

- That the Council's Environmental Health Officers were satisfied with the Stage 3 Acoustics Report regarding mitigation measures for noise pollution which would be required by condition
- That the constraints of the site meant that any eastward shift of the development , as suggested by ODRP, would result in the loss of sports facilities and acceptable emergency service access
- That the loss of some trees on the site was regrettable but it was recognised that due to the scale of the site replacement planting could not be required by Condition or an informative. The Committee hoped that future landscaping on the wider school site would seek to address this loss. The Committee realised this was not part of the determination of the application but requested officers to pursue the matter with the applicant.

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it and concluded that the current application was a marked improvement on earlier submissions and that it sought to address the concerns raised previously.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

### The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

- (a) Approve the application for the reasons given in the report and subject to the required 19 planning conditions set out in section 12, as amended to delete Condition 20, of this report and grant planning permission.
- (b) Agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:

1. Finalise the recommended conditions as set out in this report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary.

## 58. 17/01965/FUL: 22 Charlbury Road, Oxford, OX2 6UU

The Committee considered an application for the demolition of existing extensions; erection of a basement and two single storey rear extensions; insertion of 7 rooflights and alterations to landscaping including formation of a new wall and railings.

This application has been called in by Cllr Wade, Cllr Goff, Cllr Fooks and Cllr Wilkinson due to impact on the conservation area, impact of the proposed basement extension, light pollution and effects on residential amenity of a backland development.

The Planning Officer presented the report and explained that the report applies the tests of the NPPF as set out in Paragraph 10.20. However, the report does not make specific reference to the weight that is attached to the Conservation Area. For clarity, the Planning Officer confirmed that great weight is attached to the North Oxford Victorian Suburb Conservation Area as a designated heritage asset and the proposals have been assessed with this in mind and following the requirements set out in paragraphs 132-134 of the NPPF.

Oliver Miles, local resident, spoke against the application on behalf of the Linton Road Neighbourhood Association.

James Roach and Nick Worlledge (Architects) spoke in support of the application.

The Committee discussion included but was not limited to the following points:

- Confirmation from officers that appropriate landscaping and tree planting could be secured by condition
- That as this was a residential property it would not be appropriate for the Committee to seek to control any potential light pollution by condition
- That there were no policy reasons to refuse the application because of the proposal to install a car lift, turning circle and basement parking
- That the proposed landscaping treatment in the front garden, including the replacement trees, would be controlled by condition
- That the development was not considered to be out of proportion given the size and scale of the existing house and plot

The Committee considered at some length the relative merits of railings or feather edged board fencing as the preferred treatment for the front boundary. The Committee noted the arguments presented in paragraphs 10.17 and 10.18 of the report and concluded that on balance they considered that railings would not be acceptable and that the feather edged board fencing would be the better choice.

The Committee agreed that Condition 11 should be amended to require the boundary treatment to be feather edged board fencing rather than railings. In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

#### The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

- (a) Approve the application for the reasons given in the report and subject to the required 11 planning conditions set out in section 12 of this report, and to include the amendment to Condition 11 detailed above;
- (b) Agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:

1. Finalise the recommended conditions as set out in this report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary.

# 59. 17/02778/FUL: Land To The Rear Of 16 Chester Street Oxford OX4 1SN

The Committee took this application next.

The Committee considered an application for the demolition of the existing garage and erection of a two storey building to create  $1 \times 1$  bed dwellinghouse (Use Class C3) and the provision of bin a cycle store.

The application was called in by Cllrs Curran, Kennedy, Fry, Rowley, Price, Azad and Tanner because it caused a great deal of local opposition and constitutes over development of the site.

The Planning Officer presented the report and proposed the inclusion of an additional condition:

"The louvres shall be installed as shown on the approved plans and shall be retained thereafter, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority". Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to safeguard the amenities of the occupiers of nearby properties in accordance with policies CP1 of the Oxford Local Plan and HP14 of the Sites and Housing Plan.

Sarah King, local resident, spoke against the application on behalf of the Iffley Fields Residents Association.

Neil Warner (Agent) spoke in favour of the application.

The Committee discussion included but was not limited to the following points:

- The development would be categorised as Use Class C3 and it would unreasonable of the Committee to seek to control the actual number of occupants below the limit for that category
- The development would result in a net increase of one on street parking space
- There were reservations about the safety and functionality of vertical cycle parking. But there were no Council policies to prohibit the use of vertical cycle parking although it was noted that these were in place in other local authorities (e.g. Cambridge)

The Committee noted the information presented in paragraphs 10.15 to 10.27 regarding residential amenity and the National Space Standards and acknowledged the

implications of the appeal decision of the previous scheme. The Committee observed that they did not consider that the National Space Standards were as generous as they should be but accepted that this did not constitute grounds to refuse the application.

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it.

On being put to the vote a majority of the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

### The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

- (a) Approve the application for the reasons given in the report and subject to the required planning conditions set out in section 12 of this report, with the inclusion of the additional condition detailed above, and grant planning permission.
- (b) Agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:

1. Finalise the recommended conditions as set out in this report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary.

### 60. 17/02842/POM: Travis Perkins site, 6 Collins Street, Oxford

The Committee took this application next.

The Committee considered the application to modify the accompanying s106 legal agreement attached to planning permission 15/03328/FUL to allow a change in tenure of one unit from shared ownership to affordable rent.

The Planning Officer presented the report and made one correction to the report: paragraph 9.1 delete as *shown "…unit to intermediate affordable rent…*".

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

### The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

- a) Approve the modification to the legal agreement for the reasons given in the report; and
- b) Agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:
  - 1. Finalise the recommended legal agreement under section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and other enabling powers as set out in this report, including refining, adding to, amending and/or deleting the obligations detailed in the heads of terms set out in this report (including to dovetail with and where

appropriate, reinforce the final conditions and informatives to be attached to the planning permission) as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary; and

2. Complete the section 106 legal agreement referred to above.

# 61. 17/02495/RES: Westgate Shopping Centre, Bonn Square, Oxford, OX1 1NX

The Committee considered an additional reserved matters application seeking permission with respect of the uses and/or internal reconfiguration of the floorspace located in Building 2 (Upper Ground), Building 3 (Upper Ground) and Building 4 (Upper Ground, First, and Second Floors).

The Planning Officer presented the report and referred the Committee to a correction at paragraph 9.1: that the grant of planning permission was not subject to a s106 legal agreement.

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

- (a) Approve the application for the reasons given in the report and subject to the required planning conditions set out in section 12 of this report and grant planning permission
- (b) Agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:
  - Finalise the recommended conditions as set out in this report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary.

Councillor Price left the meeting at the end of this item.

## 62. 17/03039/LBC: Museum of Oxford, Town Hall, St Aldate's, Oxford

The Committee took this item last.

The Committee considered an application for proposed works to the grade II\* listed Town Hall in association with the redevelopment of the Museum of Oxford.

The Planning Officer presented the report and made the following updates to the report:

• an amended drawing has been submitted for the arched opening detail. Officers and Historic England both consider that the amended drawing overcomes the

concerns initially raised, and that this element of the proposal would no longer harm the significance of the listed building.

- Officers have applied great weight to the preservation of the grade II\* listed building, and consider that overall, the proposed scheme amounts to less than substantial harm which would be outweighed by the public benefits set out in the report.
- It is proposed that condition 9 be amended to include a part c) requiring the approval of large scale drawn details of the proposed replacement rooflight in room G.08 (lobby 1).

The Planning Office explained that the application was before the Committee at this time because Listed building Consent was required before the Museum could submit a further bid for Heritage Lottery Funding support.

In reaching its decision, the Committee considered all the information put before it.

On being put to the vote the Committee agreed with the officer recommendation.

### The West Area Planning Committee resolved to:

(a) Approve the application for the reasons given in the report and subject to the required planning conditions set out in section 12 of this report, including the amendment to Condition 9 detailed above, and grant listed building consent subject to:

1. Historic England raising no objection to the application.

## (b) Agree to delegate authority to the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services to:

Finalise the recommended conditions as set out in this report including such refinements, amendments, additions and/or deletions as the Head of Planning, Sustainable Development and Regulatory Services considers reasonably necessary.

### 63. Minutes

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 31 October as a true and accurate record.

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 12 December 2017 as a true and accurate record subject to the following correction:

Minute 46: replace with the following text

#### 16/02745/CT3

Cllr Hollingsworth - As the City Executive Board Member and the Portfolio Holder for Planning and Regulatory Services he had a pre-determined position on the application and would leave the room and take no part in its determination.

## 64. Forthcoming applications

The Committee noted the list of forthcoming applications.

## 65. Dates of future meetings

The Committee noted the dates of future meetings.

The meeting started at 6.00 pm and ended at 7.45 pm

Chair .....

Date: Wednesday 21 February 2018